

VOLUME TWENTY-SIX / NUMBER ONE
FALL 2012 ** ZANESVILLE, OHIO

2013 ANNUAL MEETING TO BE IN BOARD ROOM ONLY

In the Board of Directors' message for July 2012 (released on the Mother Church web site on the 24th), the following appears: "We're planning a fresh format for Annual Meeting 2013. The *Manual's* provision for this gathering is actually quite simple (see Article XIII, Section 1). We'll be webcasting the meeting live this year from the Director's Board Room in the Publishing House, with the Church Officers present to welcome you as you join via computer. From this room we're planning to extend our view outward -- not only to the Church plaza and other Church departments, but also to our church family around the world through Skype video." (see also October 2012 *C.S. Journal*, p. 12)

The *Church Manual* states, "No other than its officers are required to be present." In actuality, an open Annual Meeting has always included the attendance of Mother Church members from the very earliest days of the church. The question is: Why has such a radical change been planned a year in advance of the next meeting? Informed speculation suggests that the directors will announce a controversial decision or policy change, and they wish to avoid any adverse audience reaction that might occur in an open meeting with members present.

No doubt the memory of the 1992 Annual Meeting, held right after the collapse of The Monitor Channel, contributed to this decision to avoid church members in 2013. *Cable World* magazine of March 23, 1992, commented on the *Monitor's* cable channel debacle: "Although it's unclear how much of that money [\$324.9 million Mother Church investment in the electronic media] was poured directly into The Monitor Channel, that eye-popping figure has cable insiders scratching their heads, in amazement... 'It's probably up there with some of the biggest financial failures ever seen in cable,' said Kirsten Beck, author of the book *Cultivating the Wasteland* which traced cable's history."

Nathan Talbot had been elected President of The Mother Church just prior to the 1992 Annual Meeting. Pickets were outside holding protest signs as booing and shouted questions echoed inside The Extension. Clearly, Mr. Talbot had his hands full. He threatened to adjourn the meeting if the disturbances did not stop.

(*Christian Science After 1910*, pp. 184-187)

The most likely candidate for controversy in 2013 would be the Board's probable decision to join the National Council of Churches (NCC). This move has been hinted at for at least two decades, but the drumbeat for joining has become unrelenting during the last two years. (See Winter and Spring 2012 *Banners*) According to a Sheep Alert dated August 3, 2012, a meeting for local members of The Mother Church was held in the new Sunday School room in the Extension on July 9, 2012.

The guest speaker was the Reverend Dr. Michael Kinnamon, former General Secretary of the NCC. His subject was "Ecumenical Christianity and its implications for Christian Science." According to the Sheep Alert, the speaker suggested that Christian Scientists were wrong to maintain that they had the final revelation. This contradicts Mrs. Eddy's statement on page 107 of *Science and Health* where she writes of "this final revelation of the absolute divine Principle of scientific mental healing."

A Sheep Alert for July 13, 2012, includes You Tube video links to the 2012 Annual Meeting in which Shirley Paulson states that a nun who is a "very senior theologian from the Vatican" has "become a good friend of ours." Also Nathan Talbot laughingly wonders who is leavening whom.

For a full discussion of July 9th meeting and other topics dealing with the abandonment by the Board of Directors of the pure Christian Science as established by Mary Baker Eddy, visit: www.sheepmailings.org or write to: Sheep Mailings, Inc.; 5030 N. May Ave., Suite 354; Oklahoma City, OK 73112. (A donation is requested for printed versions of these reports.)

CONNECTIONS

The Reverend Dr. Michael Kinnamon was introduced at the July 9th meeting by Shirley Paulson. According to the April 2012 *Christian Science Journal*, Mrs. Paulson has been named "Head of Ecumenical Affairs for the Church of Christ, Scientist". In the same issue, she and Chet Manchester interviewed Dr. Kinnamon. (p. 42) She also wrote "Our Turn to Go to NCC Headquarters" in the December 2011 *Journal* and another article titled "Scientology or Christian Science?" in the February 2012 issue.

Shirley Paulson is married to Richard Paulson. Both Shirley and Richard graduated from Principia College in 1970. Later he was a senior vice president of Lehman

Brothers when it collapsed in the 2008 Wall Street financial crisis. Richard Paulson is the brother of Henry M. Paulson who was a top executive at Goldman Sachs from 1999 to 2006. Henry accepted an appointment as Secretary of the Treasury in the administration of President George W. Bush in 2006. He is a class taught pupil of Nathan Talbot.

CONSEQUENCES OF JOINING THE NCC

Joining the National Council of Churches implies an acceptance of the Nicene Creed and the orthodox definition of the Trinity. One key book published by the NCC is titled: *Confessing One Faith: The Origins, Meaning and Use of The Nicene Creed -- Grounds for a Common Witness -- A Guide for Ecumenical Study -- from the NCC Commission on Faith and Order*. The Nicene Creed was adopted at the Council of Nicaea in 325 A.D. (See article about the NCC Faith & Order Commission in May 14, 2012 *C.S. Sentinel*, p. 23)

Mrs. Eddy writes in her *Message for 1902*: "The ignoble conduct of his disciples towards their Master, showing their unfitness to follow him, ended in the downfall of genuine Christianity, about the year 325, and the violent death of all his disciples save one." (p. 18: 25-29)

The Nicene Creed of 325 A.D. initiated the ritualization of Jesus' teachings and the dogmatic rendering of his words and works. Because of these enforced pronouncements, healing became virtually unknown and almost completely disappeared until the year 1866. The Tenets in *Science and Health* (p.496, 497) are Mrs. Eddy's *scientific answer* to the Nicene Creed and mark the restoration of genuine, healing Christianity in the world. Christian Scientists affirm and sign a copy of the Tenets when joining The Mother Church. (MBE's deeds of trust forbid modification of Tenets)

An unspoken "wink and a nod" or other subtle disavowal of the Tenets of Christian Science by the Directors to get NCC approval would constitute the second betrayal of genuine Christianity 1,688 years after the first in 325 A.D.

Regarding ecumenism, Mrs. Eddy writes: "Until the author of this book learned the vastness of Christian Science, the fixedness of mortal illusions, and the human hatred of Truth, she cherished sanguine hopes that Christian Science would meet with immediate and universal acceptance." (S&H, p. 330:2-7)

"To obey the Scriptural command, 'Come out from among them, and be ye separate,' is to incur society's frown; but this frown, more than flatteries, enables one to be Christian." (S&H 238:6-9)

Membership in the NCC would give the Directors a respectable seat at the ecumenical table even as church membership dwindles to denominational insignificance, and resources plummet to zero.

Another possible announcement could be the discontinuation or further curtailment of the print edition of *The Christian Science Monitor* as the article "Monitor Losses" (below) suggests.

FIVE MORE CHURCH CLOSINGS

According to a comparison of the June and September 2012 issues of *The Christian Science Journal*, the following churches/societies have closed: Sun City, Arizona; Hammond, Louisiana; Minneapolis (7th), Minnesota; Fulton, New York; and Renton, Washington (merged with Burien, Washington). At the same time, First Church Berkeley, California, has been relisted as a society. Since the count began in February 1987, 883 churches have closed in the United States, and 79 have opened.

NUMBER OF BRANCH CHURCHES AND SOCIETIES WORLDWIDE

The 1951 Annual Meeting announced that there were 3,049 branches in the world: 2,279 in the United States and 770 in other countries. (July 1951 *CS Journal*, p. 328) The 1908 figure comes from *Mary Baker G. Eddy*, by Arthur Brisbane (1908). The number for 1961 was announced at that year's Annual Meeting and apparently stands as the high-water mark for the number of branch churches in the world. This indicates that nearly half of all Christian Science churches have closed in the last fifty years since 1961. The later figures were extracted from *C.S. Journals*: The 2012 number is from the September *Journal* which indicated 1153 churches in the U.S. and 513 in the rest of the world:

Branches Worldwide

1908	1,059
1951	3,049 (2,279 U.S. 770 elsewhere)
1961	3,273
1993	2,467
2011	1,673
2012	1,666 (1,153 U.S. 513 elsewhere)

PRACTITIONERS AND TEACHERS

The 1951 Annual Meeting announced that there were 10,503 practitioners worldwide. The 1908 Figure is from the Brisbane book mentioned above. The rest are from *C.S. Journal* counts from the months and years indicated:

Practitioners Worldwide

1908	3,793
Jun 1951	10,503
Jan 2000	1,833
Jan 2005	1,433
Jun 2010	1,374
Jun 2012	1,383

Teachers worldwide (Still teaching classes*)

Mar 1992	250
Jan 2000	193*
Jan 2005	172*
Jun 2010	182*
Jun 2012	167*

NINETY-NINE YEAR LEASE

The Wall Street Journal of September 11, 2012, reported: "In its latest move, the First Church of Christ,

Scientist, last month leased a 200,000-square-foot office tower in the Back Bay complex to an affiliate of Beacon Capital Partners for 99 years. Boston-based Beacon is making an upfront payment of about \$59 million for the long-term lease of the 26-story office tower, designed by I.M. Pei & Partners and Araldo A. Sossutta and built in the 1970s... The church's financial picture has changed dramatically and they need to leverage those assets... Other churches these days are turning to their valuable real-estate holdings to help make ends meet." [wsj.com]

MOTHER CHURCH FINANCES REPORTED AT ANNUAL MEETINGS

Year	Funds on hand	Gen. Fund	Expenditures	Indebtedness
2005	\$281m		\$69m	\$157,000
2006	361m	\$66m	97m	0
2007	474m	146m	97m	0
2008	496m	165m	113m	0
2009	379m		108m	0
2010	455m		102m	0
2011	514m		93m	0
2012	499m		99m	0

An April 3, 2004, *Boston Globe* article revealed that its investigation of TMC finances found "\$60 million in accounting errors in the public financial filings of the [Christian Science] church and its affiliates, mistakes officials said they were unaware of until the *Globe* brought them to their attention. Subsequently, church officials blamed them on their auditors at Ernst & Young." The church brought in Wall Street executive Edward J. Odegaard last fall "to help with fund-raising and last month was put in charge of its day-to-day finances." (www.boston.com) (Summer 2004 *Banner*)

The Mary Baker Eddy Library for the Betterment of Humanity has continued to lose money since its construction in 2000. The original capital expense for the library was approximately \$55 million. It lost \$10 million the first year, \$5 million the second, \$4 million the third, and \$3 million each year since then although the amount is probably somewhat less now with cutbacks in staffing and operating hours. Most of those listed as visitors (500,000) over the last ten years were actually school children visiting the Mapparium on field trips. Under Lee Johnson, the former archives were a very efficient and cost contained operation. (Fall 2008 *Banner* and Sep 2012 *C.S. Journal*, p. 29)

At a meeting with TMC employees held on February 4, 2004, The C.S. Publishing Society was called upon to break even by 2008 and to make a profit by 2009. (Spring 2004 *Banner*) (2-5-2004 *Wall Street Journal*)

Regarding the C.S. Publishing Society, the October 2010 *Journal* reported: "...even though we were able to reduce our operating loss from \$21.9 million to \$17.8 million last year [2009], the deficit is unsustainable and unacceptable." (p. 18)

An open letter glued to the cover of the October 2012 *Christian Science Journal* included the following:

"While continued progress is needed, we want to thank you for your role as readers and subscribers in reducing the CSPS's operating deficit by half (nearly \$11 million dollars) over the past three years... The *Journal*, *Sentinel*, and *Herald* print editions: Major design refinements will be introduced in the 2013 volume year, including visual design simplicity, enhanced readability, new editorial focus, and a standardization of all three magazines to a smaller 7"x10" size." The Full-Text edition of the Bible Lessons will also be 7"x10".

MONITOR LOSSES

The *Monitor*'s dimensions were reduced from 10"x12" to the current 9"x11" as of the April 9, 2012, issue. The *Sentinel* changed from 10 point type size to the larger 12 point type beginning with its October 24, 2011, issue. The single issue price of the *Journal* is \$9.80; the *Sentinel* is \$3.80; and the *Monitor* is \$4.00.

In the October 3, 2011, *Monitor* Editor John Yemma wrote, "Over the past three years, we've reduced our losses by 25 percent, and in the coming year we'll reduce further still. If subscriptions were to pay just the costs of producing, marketing, and delivering this publication -- not counting the global reporting that goes into it -- the price would be \$200 a year. (emphasis added) The current subscription rate is \$119. (Spring 2012 *Banner*) The unanswered question is: What would be the true subscription price if the cost of the editorial, staff writers, and foreign correspondents were also included in the calculations?

The *Monitor* has skipped publishing the weekly, print edition three times so far in 2012: January 9, July 16, and August 27.

It is not known how long the \$57 million from recently announced 99-year lease will keep the church solvent, but options are limited. Treasurer Lyon Osborn stated at the 2012 Annual Meeting that the number of donors and the amount of donations to The Mother Church continue to decline. (Video: 48 min : 48 sec)

STATUS OF THE CASSELL CASE

The Summer 2012 *Banner* reported that the court date scheduled for the week of April 23, 2012, in the case of *Maryfrances Cassell vs The Christian Science Board of Directors* had been abruptly canceled. The delay enabled Miss Cassell's attorneys to prepare additional documentation for the court. An *Amicus Curiae* (friend of the court) brief has been prepared by Buchanan Ingersoll & Rooney PC of Philadelphia. It states in very clear terms that a church based on deeds of trust is not regarded the same as hierarchical or congregational churches. (U.S. Supreme Court case: *Watson v. Jones* 1871) The express terms of the donor (in this case Mary Baker Eddy) must be adhered to in every particular, and this means court intervention if a valid complaint is presented to the court. (Spring, Summer 2012 *Banners*)

Andrew W. Hartsook
2040 Hazel Avenue
Zanesville, Ohio 43701-2222

RETURN SERVICE REQUESTED

PRST STD
U.S. POSTAGE
PAID
ZANESVILLE, OH
PERMIT NO. 761

Samuel Greenwood

The Board of Directors, through their lawyer stated: "First, as a matter fact, Mary Baker Eddy's 1892 deed conveying land in trust for the erection of a church edifice does not even mention, much less regulate church membership, either in terms of qualification, admission or excommunication... [B]ecause Mrs. Eddy's 1892 deed of trust predates the CHURCH MANUAL, it could not possibly have incorporated the CHURCH MANUAL or the provisions therein governing membership in the Church... Thus, there are simply no trust provisions governing membership in the Church for a civil court to enforce... Second, as a matter of law, this Court has long recognized that a donor's intention respecting a gift of property in trust for promoting certain religious doctrines is enforceable by the civil courts 'to restrain a diversion of property'... However, this principle protecting the land that Mrs. Eddy conveyed in trust for the erection of a church edifice is not in dispute, as Cassell does not seek judicial review to restrain or restore any such land or the church edifice thereon..."

The Board of Directors conveniently ignore *all* of Mrs. Eddy's subsequent deeds (1903 [printed in the

Church Manual), 1904, 1905, and 1906). Mrs. Eddy's 1904 Deed of Trust states: "I do further declare that nothing herein contained shall ever be construed as a waiver or as permitting a modification in any degree of the further trusts set forth in deed of Albert Metcalf to Ira O. Knapp and others...whereby it is provided that no new tenet or by-law shall be adopted, nor any tenet or by-law amended or annulled, by the grantees, unless the written consent of said MARY BAKER G. EDDY, the author of the text book, 'Science and Health, with Key to the Scriptures' be given therefor..."

On August 2, 2012, the appeals court denied a hearing of the Cassell case before the Massachusetts Supreme Judicial Court and reaffirmed *Weaver v. Wood* (1997) even though the pivotal fact in *Watson v. Jones* (1871) regarding churches founded on deeds of trust had not been uncovered in 1997. An arbitration hearing will be held after Thanksgiving. The Cassell case will go forward in another venue where it is expected that the deeds of trust provisions will be honored and where there is no reluctance to reverse a prior court decision, which courts are very reluctant to do, even if new evidence is uncovered. The new venue will be announced soon.

VOLUME TWENTY-SIX / NUMBER TWO
WINTER 2013 ** ZANESVILLE, OHIO

NATIONAL COUNCIL OF CHURCHES UPDATE

At her annual association meeting held on October 6, 2012, Christian Science teacher Judy Wolff of Arlington, Virginia, announced that the Christian Science Board of Directors definitely are planning to join the NCC. Judy Wolff is also a trustee of the Christian Science Publishing Society along with director Michael Pabst and Linda Kohler.

However, a report received by the editor of *The Banner*, a month after that confident announcement was made, indicated that a very recent change in the top leadership of the National Council of Churches has resulted a hostile attitude toward Christian Science participation. Distraught liaisons from The Mother Church now believe that the application process will have to "start over from the beginning". Mother Church membership in the NCC will almost certainly be delayed for many months if not years.

See the Winter 2012 *Banner* for a description of the subversive political history of the NCC and its call for one world government. As late as 1968, the NCC's *Approach* magazine carried an interview with Gus Hall, General Secretary of the Communist Party U.S.A., in which he stated, "We can -- we should -- work together for the same things... We can live together in a Socialist nation."

See the Fall 2012 *Banner* for a list of incompatibilities between the Tenets of Christian Science and the Nicene Creed of 325 A.D. The Nicene Creed was cobbled together by a committee during the reign of Roman Emperor Constantine and is strictly adhered to by the NCC and its members.

ECUMENICAL PUSH CONTINUES

Not content to pursue just National Council of Churches affiliation, the *Christian Science Sentinel* of November 12, 2012, carried "Prayer for Christian Unity". The article states, "Christian Science branch churches and societies who want to participate at any level can download the 45-page 'Resources' from the World Council of Churches website [which is given in the article]... [T]he theme will inspire a renewed love for the Bible and its relevance to the world." (p. 23)

The question arises: Which Bible are they talking about? The "helpful" answer to this question comes

from the Mary Baker Eddy Library for the Betterment of Humanity.

THE PUSH FOR THE REVISED STANDARD VERSION OF THE BIBLE

The December 2012 *Christian Science Journal* carried an article titled, "Mary Baker Eddy and Bible Translations" by Michael Davis. He is described as "a researcher at The Mary Baker Eddy Library in Boston".

Readers may remember the Church Alive! Summit held in Orlando, Florida, in the spring of 2012 and the panel discussion led by Lesley Pitts, Executive Manager & President of the MBE library and researcher Michael Davis.

The pair enumerated their reasons why the full-text *Quarterly* does not violate Mrs. Eddy's standards given in the by-laws and why First and Second Readers might also use the full-text *Quarterly* rather than reading from the actual books -- the Bible and *Science and Health*.

In the February 2012 *Christian Science Journal*, the C. S. Board of Directors stated, "There are many good reasons for reading from the books, but there may be equally good reasons to read from the Full Text." (p. 64) In the *Church Manual*, Mrs. Eddy emphatically requires: "The Readers shall not read from copies or manuscripts, but from the books." (p.32) [See also Spring 2012 article in *The Banner* titled "Sophistry in the C.S. Journal".]

At the Florida Church Alive! Summit, Ms. Pitts and Mr. Davis also suggested that Mrs. Eddy did not necessarily prefer the King James Version of the Bible. [See "Deconstructing the Manual" in the Summer 2012 *Banner* for a full account of the panel discussion.]

Mr. Davis spends most of his recent *Journal* article trying to undermine the fact that Mrs. Eddy preferred the King James Version over other Bible translations: "Thus the historical record provides no evidence that Mary Baker Eddy 'ordained' the King James Version as the only Bible translation to be used in Christian Science services..."

In *Science and Health*, Mrs. Eddy refers to "our common version" of the Scriptures on pages 488:12 and 523:3. She writes of "our version of the Old Testament" on page 576:26. By these references she means the King James Version of the Bible. Bible quotations in *Science and Health* are from the KJV.

Mr. Davis notes: "First appearing in 1881, the Revised Version became a step toward later translations such as the Revised Standard Version and New Revised

Standard Version that in time largely replaced the King James Version among Protestant churches and their members. These translations had evolved from the American Standard Version (1901) that was Eddy's source for the motto of *The Christian Science Monitor*. Today many scholars believe the New Revised Standard Version to be the most accurate English translation of the Bible." (Emphasis added)

[Editor's note: The *Monitor's* motto reads: "First the blade, then the ear, then the full grain in the ear." Essentially, Mrs. Eddy only substituted a single word: "grain" in place of "corn".]

HISTORY OF BIBLE VERSIONS

The King James Version of the New Testament (A.D. 1611) is a strict translation of the Greek Textus Receptus which was assembled by Desiderius Erasmus (1466-1537), one of the greatest scholars of Western Civilization. This text is in basic agreement with 90 to 95% of all known Scripture related manuscripts numbering over 5000. The King James New Testament and Martin Luther's German New Testament agree 100% with the Textus Receptus. The Revised Standard New Testament has 189 omissions and the American Revised has 183 omissions of words/phrases found in the KJV.

The English Revised Version of 1881 and the American Standard Version of 1901 are based in large part on the Codex Sinaiticus and Codex Vaticanus which are filled with errors and contradictions. The Codex Vaticanus was discovered in the Vatican library in 1481 and was known by English scholars, but was not available to them for obvious reasons. The Codex Sinaiticus was discovered in 1844 in the wastebasket of a monastery at the foot of Mount Sinai. The discoverer of the Codex Sinaiticus noted at least 12,000 changes which had been made on that manuscript by others than the original copyist.

The Codices Vaticanus and Sinaiticus are in basic agreement with each other, but both differ markedly from the vast majority of other Scripture manuscripts in existence. In spite of this fact, these two codices became the basis of the English Revised Version of 1881 and the American Standard Version of 1901 as well as almost every other modern translation of the New Testament down to the present day.

LITTLE KNOWN VITAL FACTS

According to *Perfected or Perverted? A Shocking Expose of the Modern Versions of the Bible* by Norman Ward, "[The Textus Receptus] originated in Antioch where the disciples were first called Christians (Acts 11:26). It was written on papyrus in Koine Greek [language of the common man] as were the original letters. This text traveled from Syria, through the Balkans to Germany and, thence, to England. It was the

text of the primitive church. It was the text of the Greek church. It was the text of Martin Luther and the Reformation. It is the text of the Protestant Church.

"We will now examine the second line of ascension, the line that supports the modern versions. This line of ascension begins in Alexandria, Egypt, the Land of Bondage. From there it moves on to Rome... This line of text is written on vellum in classical Greek. Remember the New Testament was written on papyrus in Koine Greek. It is important to note the difference between classical Greek and Koine Greek for three reasons: (1) Since the New Testament was written in Koine Greek, the manuscript copy in Koine Greek is apt to have a closer reading. (2) There are some 500 words in Koine Greek which are used in the New Testament which cannot be translated into classical Greek. (3) The majority of early Christians accepted manuscripts in Koine Greek in preference to manuscripts in classical Greek. This corrupt line of ascension accounts for only five percent of manuscript evidence. Let me repeat that: Only five percent of manuscript evidence supports this line of text.

"On February 10, 1870, the Southern Convocation of the Church of England passed a resolution expressing the desirability of revising the Authorized Version of 1611 (King James Version). The clear intent of the Southern Convocation can be noted in the following quote: 'We do not contemplate any new translation of the Bible or any alternation of the language, except, when in the judgment of the most competent scholars, such changes are necessary.' What actually happened is quite a different story. Instead of being a revision of the A.V. 1611, the Revised Version is actually a whole new Bible that threw out entirely the time-tested, God-honored, fruit-bearing, life-changing, Christ-exalting A.V. 1611.

"The story of the Revised Version [published in 1881] (and all subsequent modern Bibles) is really the story of two men, B.F. Westcott and F.J.A. Hort. Westcott and Hort were two well known Greek scholars who dominated the Revision Committee... [T]hey detested the A.V. 1611 and the Greek text on which it was based. Their expressed purpose was to 'rid the church of that vile text'... What they insisted upon was a brand new translation based on the brand new Greek text [the Codices Vaticanus and Sinaiticus]... Every Bible published today, except for the A.V. 1611, is based on the work of Westcott and Hort." [End quotations]

The English Revised Version of 1881 and the American Standard Version of 1901 were both available to Mrs. Eddy, but she chose the King James Version.

One must ask: Why do Christian Science Board of Directors and their Mary Baker Eddy Library for the

Betterment of Humanity push for the Revised Versions? MRS. EDDY COMMENTS ON NEW BIBLES

In her *Message for 1901* (the same year that the American Revised Version appeared) Mrs. Eddy writes: "Have we misread the evangelical precepts and the canonical writings of the Fathers, or must we have a new Bible and a new system of Christianity, originating not in God, but a creation of the schools -- a material religion, proscriptive, intolerant, wantonly bereft of the Word of God." (34:10-15) Later on the same page she urges the reader: "...study the Bible and the textbook of our denomination..." clearly meaning the KJV and Science and Health. (34:23,24 emphasis added)

One of Mrs. Eddy's most frequently quoted KJV Bible passages (Mark 16:17, 18) has either been removed from the revised Bible versions or relegated to fine print in a footnote where it is said to be of doubtful origin.

UPDATE ON THE CASSELL CASE

An arbitration hearing in the case of Maryfrances Cassell vs. the Christian Science Board of Directors was scheduled for November 20, 2012. It was abruptly canceled. A new date of December 4th was scheduled, and it was canceled. A third court date has now been set for February 13, 2013.

Regardless of the outcome of that hearing, the case will go forward in another venue. The next phase is already in the planning stage. Miss Cassell's brief contends that Mrs. Eddy established her church, in accordance with the 1871 U.S. Supreme Court decision (Watson vs. Jones), as a deed of trust based church and is, therefore, a private trust, not a public charitable trust.

The trustees are to obey all the deeds of trust including those from 1892, 1903, 1904, 1905, and 1906 and not just the 1892 deed as alleged by their lawyer (July 16, 2012).

As the ignored 1904 deed emphatically states: "nothing herein contained shall ever be construed as a waiver or as permitting a modification in any degree the further trusts set forth...wherein it is provided that no new tenet or by-law shall be added nor any tenet or by-law amended or annulled by the grantees, unless the written consent of said Mary Baker G. Eddy, the author of the text book 'Science and Health with Key to the Scriptures' be given therefor..."

IMMEDIATE NEED FOR SUPPORT

The legal expenses for this case continue to mount. To expedite the process *at this time*, contributors are asked to send funds directly to the law firm: **Foehl & Eyre P.C.** Please write "Cassell Case" in the memo section of your check. Address: Attn: Robert Eyre

Foehl & Eyre P.C.
27 E. Front St.
Media, PA 19063

EIGHT MORE CHURCH CLOSINGS

A comparison of the September 2012 and December 2012 issues of *The Christian Science Journal* reveals that the following eight churches have closed: Gadsden, Alabama; Page, Arizona; Bristol, Connecticut; Des Plaines, Illinois; Providence (Soc.) Rhode Island; Seneca-Clemson, South Carolina; Oak Ridge, Tennessee; and Marinette, Wisconsin. At the same time, the Lancaster, Virginia, church has changed its name to Kilmarnock, Virginia. Fourteenth Church, Seattle, Washington, has become a society. A new church has been established in Anderson, South Carolina. Since the count began in February 1987, **891** churches have closed, and **80** have opened.

SENTINEL SUBSCRIPTION FIGURES

The October 22, 2012 *Christian Science Sentinel* gave the required U.S. Postal Service statement of current, paid circulation: 23,403.

1933	170,784	
1997	44,995	
1998	50,868	*life style edition began
1999	53,290	
2000	46,342	
2001	48,899	
2002	48,260	
2003	45,047	
2004	37,778	
2005	36,384	
2006	34,773	
2007	32,341	
2008	30,154	
2009	24,130	
2010	25,720	
2011	24,016	
2012	23,403	

MONITOR LOSES 19.5% OF ITS PAID SUBSCRIPTIONS IN A SINGLE YEAR

The required U.S. Postal Service statement appearing in the October 8, 2012, *Christian Science Monitor* reveals that the weekly edition has lost 14,537 paid subscribers in one year or 19.5% of the total.

1933	129,260	
1989	156,246	*Color format, fewer
1990	116,709	pages & greatly
1991	115,117	reduced advertising
1992	107,652	begin.
1993	103,607	
1994	96,352	
1995	86,479	
1996	85,679	
1997	77,507	
1998	77,093	
1999	72,498	
2000	73,079	
2001	70,324	
2002	77,310	
2003	72,463	
2004	63,794	
2005	54,726	
2006	57,027	
2007	52,813	
2008	47,725	
2009	48,435	*weekly format begins
2010	76,869	
2011	74,312	
2012	59,775	

Andrew W. Hartsook
2040 Hazel Avenue
Zanesville, Ohio 43701-2222

RETURN SERVICE REQUESTED

PRST STD
U.S. POSTAGE
PAID
ZANESVILLE, OH
PERMIT NO. 761

Laura E. Sargent

2012 NORMAL CLASS

The triennial normal class to prepare teachers of Christian Science was held in December of 2012. Mary Metzner Trammell taught the class. The new, authorized teachers are: James Pascal Bikai, Yaounde, Cameroon; Mary Bothwell, Pasadena, California; Diana Davis Butler, Fresno, California; Cynthia L. Clague, Eugene, Oregon; Stormy Becker Falso, Atlanta, Georgia; T. Michael Fish, Clifton, Virginia; Antonio Gongu, Luanda, Angola; Klaus-Hendrik Herr, Berlin, Germany; Paula Violet Jensen-Mounton, Canton, New York; Gary Jones, Washington, D.C.; Neera Kapur, Philippines; Jan K. Keeler, Austin, Texas; Muanda Joachim Kinanga, Boma Bas-Congo, Dem. Republic of Congo; Brian J.S. Kissock, Belfast, Northern Ireland; Jenny Lobl, London, England; Susan Booth Mack, Bangor, Maine; Chet Manchester, St. Louis, Missouri; Mabllala Mavungu, Kinshasa, Dem. Republic of Congo; Anne Melville, Kaikohe, New Zealand; Jane Kanugu Mirianki, Nanyuki, Kenya; Thomas Richard Mitchinson, Naperville, Illinois; Betty Jean O'Neal, Lynn, Massachusetts; Monica Esefer Passaglia, Caseros, Buenos Aires, Argentina; Brian G. Pennix, San Francisco, California;

Georgia Reed, Concord, New Hampshire; Laurie Q. Richardson, St. Louis, Missouri; Jose Rodriguez-Pelaez, Alhaurin, El Grande, Spain; Mary Alice Rose, Brookeville, Maryland; Enrique Smeke, Miami, Florida; Lisa Rumie Sysma, Denver, Colorado.

FROM DIVINITY COURSE & GENERAL COLLECTANEA

We each dwell in our own world of consciousness. We look out through the windows of this consciousness and behold the passing procession of mortal mind. Day after day we have been lured forth, have been pressed into the whirl, lost our individual peace and poise in divine Mind, and found ourselves dragged through the uncleanness, the pain of the procession. We seek to regain our own home of consciousness, wiser for the experience, thinking that we will not again become part of error's pageant: but here let the newer understanding of Love guard well your door. Stay in your own home of demonstration. Keep your peace, for idle curiosity, criticism, or even false sympathy may lure you forth... We have all in some way needed the experience we have had. Never be found as a Christian Scientist mourning over an experience. It is a thing of the past, but not so the manifold power and presence of God resulting therefrom. --Attributed to Mrs. Eddy. (p. 216)

VOLUME TWENTY-SIX / NUMBER THREE
 SPRING 2013 ** ZANESVILLE, OHIO

CASSELL CASE: ARBITRATION HEARING

An arbitration hearing was held in the case of Maryfrances Cassell v. The Christian Science Board of Directors on February 15, 2013. The Directors demanded \$47,800.00 in attorney fees from Miss Cassell and asserted, once again, that her suit against them is "frivolous".

In response, Miss Cassell's attorney, Robert Eyre, cited the 1871 U.S. Supreme Court decision in the case of *Watson v. Jones* demonstrating that the Directors do not enjoy the autonomy of congregational or hierarchical religious organizations because Mrs. Eddy deliberately established her church on the basis of deeds of trust which are subject to the review of the probate court if the trust provisions are violated by the Directors. Such a finding could result in their removal from office. Clearly, Mrs. Eddy anticipated this possibility. The third basis for founding a church organization -- the deed of trust -- is very rarely used, and as a result it has been overlooked in all previous court cases until its recent rediscovery by Robert Eyre.

In confirmation of this, a letter dated September 8, 1915, from Mrs. Eddy's longtime lawyer, Frank S. Streeter, to the Board of Directors states:

"The organization of the Mother Church rests upon the powers conferred by general statute*, combined with powers created by the Founder [Mrs. Eddy]. In all church organizations resting on the statute, the ultimate management and control of all the temporal and spiritual concerns of the church is vested solely in the beneficiaries, namely, the **church members...** [emphasis added] If the Church members or any considerable number thereof shall be aroused to challenge at law the board's power of exclusive control conferred by the Founder in disregard of the statutes on which the Church is based and which confer exclusive control on the members, this question of power of control by the board conferred by the Founder, or power of control by the Church members conferred by the statutes will immediately be raised." (*Chapter 39 of Public Statutes of Mass. later renumbered Chapter 68) [*Proceedings in Equity*, p. 736]

Miss Cassell's lawyer also pointed out that the recent U.S. Supreme Court decision, *Hosanna-Tabor Evangelical Lutheran Church v. E.E.O.C.* (2012),

established "that First Amendment autonomy principles do not deprive the courts of subject matter jurisdiction to review the actions or decisions of religious institutions..." Also Mrs. Eddy's governing documents not only set up the Trust, but also define and restrict it. "...the same By-Laws (in the *Church Manual*) that the Defendants [CSBD] relied upon for their authority to remove Plaintiff [Miss Cassell] as a Member Beneficiary also impose upon her a duty as a member to complain about Director misconduct... [A] contract must be construed as a whole and ... one provision cannot be interpreted in a manner that renders another meaningless..."

Miss Cassell's lawyer also pointed out that the Directors "were paying themselves excessive salaries in violation of Article I, Section 9, of the *Church Manual*. Plaintiff notes in her affidavit that the Defendants do not tell the Member Beneficiaries what they pay themselves from Trust assets."

Interestingly, Frank S. Streeter's 1915 letter to the Directors was prompted by his alarm that they had increased their own salaries from the *Manual's* stipulated \$2500 to \$8000 or \$10,000. The Spring 2006 *Banner* reported that the Directors are now paying themselves in excess of \$200,000 each.

On the basis of the newly discovered provision for a deed of trust based church and the 2012 U.S. Supreme Court decision that courts are not deprived of subject matter jurisdiction to review decisions of religious institutions, Miss Cassell is asking for reconsideration of her suit in the Massachusetts courts.

The case was heard in the court of Judge Elaine Moriarty of the Suffolk County Probate and Family Court. No decision had been announced as this newsletter goes to press.

THE DIRECTORS REVEAL THEMSELVES

In a document submitted to the court dated March 6, 2013, the Directors assert the following: "Mrs. Eddy's 1892 deed of trust clearly concerned a conveyance of land to the board in trust for the erection of a church edifice to be used for the charitable purpose of public worship... There is not a word in Mrs. Eddy's deed, itself, that has anything to do with the election of church members; the qualifications of church members or the discipline of church members... [...] Nonetheless, Cassell argues that Mrs. Eddy's 1892 deed somehow incorporated the Church Manual and that the Manual imposes trust obligations upon the Board with regard to the discipline

of church members. This argument, itself, is frivolous because it lacks any colorable basis in fact. Certainly there is nothing in Mrs. Eddy's 1892 deed that incorporates the Church Manual. Further, Mrs. Eddy did not even prepare the 1st edition of the Church Manual until September 1895, three years after she executed the deed. Finally, Mrs. Eddy continued to revise the Church Manual eight-eight times over the next fifteen years, until her death in 1910; so it is impossible to determine what provisions of what Church Manual would even apply to the Board under her 1892 deed. The Board does acknowledge that the 89th edition of the Church Manual governs its discipline of church members, but only as a matter of internal church polity protected under the church autonomy doctrine, not as a matter of secular trust law enforceable in the civil courts.

"In sum, there is simply no colorable basis in fact to suggest that the Church Manual imposes any legally enforceable trust obligations upon the Board, either in general or specifically with regard to church discipline. [...] In sum, because there is no colorable basis in fact to support the incorporation of the Church Manual in any of Mrs. Eddy's deeds of trust; and, because there is no colorable basis in law to apply Watson to Cassell's claims concerning her wrongful excommunication, all such claims are wholly frivolous." [emphasis added]

THE IGNORED DEEDS OF TRUST

The Directors' presentation to the court completely ignores Mrs. Eddy's Deeds of Trust of 1903, 1904, 1905, and 1906 as if they did not even exist. The statement that "there is no colorable basis in fact to support the incorporation of the Church Manual in any of Mrs. Eddy's deeds of trust" is **a demonstrable lie** and a **barefaced prevarication**.

The 1903 Deed of Trust is incorporated in the *Church Manual* on page 136 (right after the 1892 Deed) and requires: "...this property is conveyed on the further trusts that no new Tenet or By-Law shall be adopted, nor any Tenet or By-Law amended or annulled by the grantees unless the written consent of said Mary Baker G. Eddy, the author of the textbook 'Science and Health with Key to the Scriptures,' be given therefor..."

MICHAEL RITCHIE OF SCOTLAND

Mrs. Eddy's Deeds of Trust of 1904, 1905, and 1906 were almost completely unknown until Michael Ritchie of Scotland labored to bring them to light. Working with a New Hampshire resident, he was able to get photostatic copies of all the original deeds with the exception of the 1905 deed. In the latter case, a transcribed copy is available. Clearly, it was in the interest of the Directors to suppress these documents and deny them to the Christian Science field.

As the 1904 Deed of Trust states: "nothing herein

contained shall ever be construed as a waiver or as permitting a modification in any degree the further trusts set forth...wherein it is provided that no new tenet or by-law shall be ~~added~~ nor any tenet or by-law amended or annulled by the grantees [the Directors], unless the written consent of said Mary Baker G. Eddy, the author of the text book 'Science and Health with Key to the Scriptures' be given therefor..."

MANUAL JAIL

Tom Black's contemptuous statement regarding the by-laws at the June 6, 2011, Annual Meeting begins to make sense in light of the Directors' March 6, 2013, submission to the court:

"Would you mind if we kept ourselves out of the Manual jail and would ask the Committee on Publication to give his report...?" In response, the current C.O.P. Russ Gerber said, "Thank you, Tom. Thank you. Much better to be outside the jail; I agree."

Subsequently, Tom Black resigned from the board on September 23, 2011, and died on December 6, 2011. [See Summer and Fall 2011 *Banners*]

ANNULMENT OF THE BY-LAWS

The Christian Science Board of Directors passed the following resolution on August 6, 1993:

"IT IS NOW HEREBY FURTHER RESOLVED that it is and has long been the determination of the Board both (a) that it is implicit in any decision of The Christian Science Board of Directors to take or refrain from taking any action that the taking or refraining from the taking of such action does not violate any provision of the Manual of The Mother Church and (b) that no determination of The Christian Science Board of Directors at any time that purports to apply the provisions of the Manual of The Mother Church either (1) can or does prohibit or invalidate any action thereafter taken by The Christian Science Board of Directors or (2) can or does prohibit or invalidate any subsequent determination of The Christian Science Board of Directors purporting to apply the provisions of the Manual of The Mother Church in a different manner, whether such subsequent determination be explicit or implicit." The resolution was signed by Olga M. Chaffee, Clerk of The Mother Church.

THE SOON TO BE ANNULLED TENETS?

The Winter 2013 *Banner* reported that the Directors' application for membership in the National Council of Churches (NCC) had been rebuffed in either October or November of 2012. A requirement for membership in the NCC is the adoption of the Nicene Creed of 325 A.D. along with the orthodox concept of the Trinity. The Tenets of The Mother Church constitute Mrs. Eddy's *scientific answer* to the Nicene creed. Joining the NCC would mean the annulment of the Tenets

which is prohibited by Mrs. Eddy's deeds of trust. Not content with rejection from the NCC, Shirley Paulson, "Head of Ecumenical Affairs for the Church of Christ, Scientist", traveled to Geneva, Switzerland, to inquire about membership in the World Council of Churches (WCC). The WCC also subscribes to and requires the adoption of Nicene Creed by member churches. The push for ecumenical "dialogue" with the WCC was highlighted in the November 12, 2012, *C.S. Sentinel*.

CAN'T WE ALL JUST GET ALONG?

In the April 2012 *C.S. Journal*, Shirley Paulson writes, "...I became interested in joining my local clergy association after I had become a Christian Science practitioner. When I began to go to meetings and I would start to explain something about myself or ask questions, there was this horribly unpleasant silence in the room... Why did we become so isolated?" (pp. 42, 43) To answer Ms. Paulson, we did not *become* isolated; Christian Science was *rejected* by other Christian denominations *from the beginning*. Nothing has changed. That is why Mrs. Eddy writes: "Until the author of this book learned the vastness of Christian Science, the fixedness of mortal illusions, and the human hatred of Truth, she cherished sanguine hopes that Christian Science would meet with immediate and universal acceptance." (S&H p. 330) For this reason, the Directors' and Ms. Paulson's fetish for ecumenism is no small trifle. "Dialogue to consensus" would result in the loss of the purity of the Christian Science that Mrs. Eddy labored to establish. The current Directors and Ms. Paulson would exchange our birthright for "a seat at the ecumenical table" just as Esau traded his birthright for pottage and lentils. (Gen. 25: 29-34)

Just as the First Century Jews rejected the Messiah, so the Nineteenth and Twentieth Century Christian churches rejected the promised Comforter.

NON-CHANGES ON THE BOARD

Mary Metzner Trammell (John Hoagland's cousin) resigned from the Christian Science Board of Directors on January 14, 2013, and was replaced by Robin Hoagland (John Hoagland's daughter-in-law). See the Fall 2009 *Banner* for other Hoagland influences dating back to the 1940s. See also the Winter and Spring 2009 *Banners* for Mrs. Trammell's strange connection to the astrology web site, Planetwaves.

899 CHURCHES CLOSED

A comparison of the December 2012 and March 2013 issues of *The Christian Science Journal* reveals that the following nine churches have closed: Cherokee Valley, Arkansas; Los Angeles (38th), California; Merced, California; Suisun, California; Stratford-Bridgeport, Connecticut; Kailua, Hawaii; Stillwater, Minnesota; Cincinnati (2nd), Ohio; and Newport (Middletown), Rhode Island.

Correction: The church in Seneca-Clemson, South Carolina, did not close as reported in the Winter 2013 *Banner*, but relocated to Anderson, South Carolina.

Since the count began in February 1987, 899 churches and societies have closed and 79 have opened.

HOW THINGS WENT WRONG

Christian Science began without organized churches and was not even recognized as an identified denomination. It began with Mrs. Eddy teaching classes and people reading her textbook, *Science and Health* (1875). It was all about healing and metaphysics. It was said that Christian Science recruited its members, not from other denominations, but from the graveyards. The healing of chronic and fatal diseases brought thousands of people to rented meeting halls and private homes in search of health and a clearer understanding of God. Mrs. Eddy first organized a church in 1879, but saw trends taking place that she wished to avoid. She dissolved this first organization and replaced it in 1892 based on a deed of trust. Four more restrictive deeds followed. After 1910, the church became increasingly polarized between metaphysicians and careerists. The metaphysicians were motivated purely by the healing mission and did countless outstanding works of healing.

The careerists were those who no doubt entered the church with good intentions and could speak and write about Christian Science, but for one reason or another they never equaled the healing works of the single-minded metaphysicians who sought no personal advancement. In time, the careerists found that through networking and selective gushing (Webster: effusive display of enthusiasm), they could be noticed and promote their careers within the church and maybe rise to the top of the administration in Boston. There was plenty of honor, praise, and adulation for those who reached the pinnacle. The great teacher and lecturer John Randall Dunn called the gushers "the molasses crowd". However, the careerists were acutely aware that they could not heal like the selfless metaphysicians in the field, and this provoked envy, jealousy, and revenge -- just those things that Mrs. Eddy warns about so often in *Miscellaneous Writings* and *Miscellany*. Mabel Brill, longtime secretary to teacher and lecturer Bicknell Young revealed after his passing that the Directors were constantly questioning, criticizing, and menacing him. Martha Wilcox was threatened with discipline because she shared reminiscences of her time in Mrs. Eddy's household with her association of pupils.

Today, the brightest lights in the field are punished for being too popular. Teachers have had their lecturing taken away because their success provoked jealousy in other teachers who had "friends in Boston". Some have been put on probation and had their listing removed from *The Christian Science Journal*. Over time, if they kept

Andrew W. Hartsook
2040 Hazel Avenue
Zanesville, Ohio 43701-2222

PRST STD
U.S. POSTAGE
PAID
ZANESVILLE, OH
PERMIT NO. 761

RETURN SERVICE REQUESTED

Michael Ritchie

their mouths shut and showed appropriate contrition, they would first get their practitioner listing restored, and if all went well, their teaching status was also renewed. In one case, a teacher was removed from the *Journal* for several years merely for being a silent witness in accordance with the Matthew Code. Others have been removed and excommunicated for obeying Article I, Section 9, of the *Church Manual*.

Maryfrances Cassell's father, James Calder Cassell was renowned as an instantaneous healer in the 1930s and 1940s. Other practitioners in his city complained to Boston that he was stealing their patients. As a result, Mr. Cassell's practitioner listing was permanently removed from the *Journal*. Over time, true metaphysicians in the field have learned to keep their heads down and to speak in bland generalities to anyone outside their trusted, inner circle.

Until the arrival and domination of Harvey Wood in Boston, there were always one or two true metaphysicians on the Board of Directors and others scattered around the various administration offices and in the Publishing Society. Mr. Wood demanded unanimity on the Board. If anyone dissented, that one was voted

out. Only yes-men were tolerated from then on. Since that time, one reasonably could argue that there are no true metaphysicians in the Boston administration today.

One must ask: How is it possible for Christian Science to advance today if the truly inspired are afraid to give their highest sense of Truth? The answer is that Christian Science cannot go forward with jealous and domination-obsessed careerists in charge. When one considers that the promised Comforter has been denied to suffering people around the world for 100 years, one must agree that this tyranny of petty minds constitutes a crime against humanity. Mrs Eddy writes: "Let the Word have free course and be glorified. The people clamor to leave cradle and swaddling-clothes. The spiritual status is urging its highest demands on mortals, and material history is drawing to a close. Truth cannot be stereotyped; it unfoldeth forever." (No & Yes, p. 45)

IMMEDIATE SUPPORT STILL NEEDED

The legal expenses in the Cassell case continue to accrue. To expedite the process, contributors are asked to send funds directly to the law firm: **Foehl & Eyre P.C., 27 East Front St., Media, PA 19063 USA.** Please write "Cassell Case" in the memo section of your check.

VOLUME TWENTY-SIX / NUMBER FOUR
SUMMER 2013 ** ZANESVILLE, OHIO

DECONSTRUCTING THE LESSON-SERMON

As reported in the Spring 2012 *Banner*, the Christian Science Board of Directors has initiated a subtle campaign to transform the Sunday services in branch churches and to nullify Mrs. Eddy's specific direction for Readers to read directly from the Bible and *Science and Health* in church services: "The Readers shall not read from copies or manuscripts, but from the books." (*Church Manual*, Article III, Section 4, p. 32)

The February 2012 *Christian Science Journal* carried a statement from the Directors titled "Church Services Alive!" which included, "There are many good reasons for reading from the books, but there may be equally good reasons to read from the Full Text". (p. 64) Such a statement can only be labeled for what it is: **willful disobedience** to Mrs. Eddy's Deeds of Trust which require the directors, as trustees, not to amend or annul the by-laws.

Another article in this subtle campaign titled "The Bible Lesson. A flexible format that supports ideas" states: "[Mrs.] Eddy gave the Bible Lesson Committee very few instructions about the structure of the Bible Lessons, and over the years the format varied. For instance, one lesson had only eight Bible citations, while another, a month later, had 27." (June 2013 *C.S. Journal*, p. 31)

Right on schedule, the July-September 2013 citation edition of the *Christian Science Quarterly Bible Lessons* states: "...in the last decade, the Bible Lesson Committee, the group charged by [Mrs.] Eddy with compiling the lessons, has been compiling lessons with the same flexibility it originally had, allowing the ideas presented in the lesson to determine the form that it should take.

"One component of that flexibility is the number of citations used in the lesson. For many decades the maximum number of citations from the Bible was twenty-four and from *Science and Health* thirty, although earlier lessons often had more citations. The maximum numbers now have been increased to twenty-six and thirty-two respectively." (p. 64) The lesson for August 12-18, 2013, has thirty-two citations for *Science and Health*.

As every Christian Scientist knows, the sets of

markers used for the King James Bible and *Science and Health* include twenty-four for the Scriptures and thirty for the Christian Science textbook. So it will now be increasingly difficult for Readers or other church members who wish to obey Mrs. Eddy's by-law to mark their weekly lesson using the actual books.

So now, the manufactured wisdom and foresight of the Christian Science Board of Directors way back in February 2012 becomes clear: "There may be equally good reasons to read from the Full Text."

It is reasonable to speculate that the Boston administration hopes that Readers and other church members will become so frustrated by the endless tinkering with the Bible lessons that they will capitulate, abandon the marking of their books, and begin reading from the Full Text edition. Once this becomes the norm, the Directors then will feel free to invade the body of the lesson-sermon with Bible translations and paraphrases other than the King James Version which Mrs. Eddy specifically endorses and refers to in her writings as "Our Common Version". (S&H 488:12, 523:21, and 576:26)

UPDATING SHAKESPEARE

If Shakespeare were subjected to the same treatment as the King James Version of the Bible, we might find the original "Friends, Romans, countrymen, lend me your ears" updated to modern English as "Friends, Romans, countrymen, loan me your ears." (Noun or verb? Who cares.) A modern paraphrase might read: "Friends, Romans, countrymen, I got something I want to tell you."

Shakespeare and the King James Bible represent the Golden Age of the English language which every native speaker should wish to maintain as a timeless anchor and mainstay even if it does require some self-education and effort by latter-day students.

ECUMENICAL TOOL

The May 2013 *C.S. Journal* continues the directors' push for ecumenism. It recommends downloading Shirley Paulson's *A Self-Understanding of Christian Science* [christianscience.com/self-understanding]. The nine-page paper is crafted to convince other denominations that Christian Science is compatible with their theology and worthy of inclusion in organizations such as the National Council of Churches and the World Council of Churches. Interestingly, Mrs. Paulson states that there is "no church hierarchy". (p.1) Yet, the directors added a memorandum in the Weaver v. Wood

case [1994-1998] stating that, indeed, they do constitute a hierarchy. The directors' application for membership in the NCC was rejected in November 2012. The push for ecumenism has resulted in some unintended consequences. The decline of the C.S. church over the last fifty years had led other denominations to write off Christian Science as irrelevant and no longer worth serious opposition. The continual push by Shirley Paulson, Head of Ecumenical Affairs of The First Church of Christ, Scientist, for acceptance has instead re-ignited the old hostility.

ECUMENISM IN ACTION

In the wake of the Boston marathon bombing of April 15, 2013, an interfaith memorial service was organized for April 18th. President Obama was scheduled to attend. Lyle Young, Chairman of the Board of Directors, was invited to participate in the service, and he gladly accepted. The Mother Church has been a prominent fixture in Boston for more than one hundred years as the headquarters of the worldwide Christian Science church, and the representation by its board chairman at the service seemed logical. Ecumenical outreach finally seemed to be paying off. However, soon after the surprise invitation, another telephone call dis-invited Mr. Young with the explanation that there was a lack of space on the platform. He was told that others also had their invitations rescinded.

JOHN HOAGLAND JR.

The Banner received a reliable report on May 5, 2013, that John Hoagland, Jr., died on May 1st of this year. Mr. Hoagland was former manager of the Christian Science Publishing Society, Publisher's Agent for the Writings of Mary Baker Eddy, Trustee of the Publishing Society, and President and CEO of Monitor Television, Inc.

Previously, he worked for the U.S. Central Intelligence Agency from 1952 to 1961. Later he headed Hoagland & MacLachlan International, a marketing research firm in Wellesley, Massachusetts. Robert MacLachlan was one of former director John Selover's closest personal friends. Mr. MacLachlan was assigned numerous special consulting jobs for the Publishing Society and the Church. Current C.O.P. Russ Gerber was another close friend of Mr. MacLachlan.

On the board of directors of Hoagland & MacLachlan was former C.I.A. figure Richard Bissell who was linked to the failed Bay of Pigs invasion of Castro's Cuba in 1961 which used Cuban exiles as cat's-paws for the operation.

Interestingly, an internet Google search reveals almost zero information about Mr. Hoagland. Perhaps it is the privilege of former C.I.A. agents to have their personal histories scrubbed from the public record.

Mr. Hoagland is best known in church circles for his

electronic news ventures including short-wave, broadcast television, and cable TV. In September of 1988, *World Monitor*, a half-hour television news program, debuted on the Discovery Channel. *World Monitor*, a monthly magazine appeared one month later in October.

A decision by the directors and Mr. Hoagland to reduce the daily *Monitor* to a sixteen-page paper with color and no advertising was the spark which led to the mass resignation of the newspaper's editor, Katherine Fanning, and many other top writers and assistants. Previously, a decision to eliminate the daily newspaper entirely was discovered by Mrs. Fanning. It was only then that the Directors and Mr. Hoagland backed away from that plan in favor of the scaled down *Monitor*. The newspaper's advertising was diverted to the new monthly *World Monitor* magazine.

In spite of huge financial losses already incurred, the 24-hour Monitor Channel debuted on May 1, 1991. In the end, every facet of the electronic media empire failed. This was followed by the resignations of John Hoagland, Publishing Society manager Netty Douglass (later John Hoagland's second wife), and director Harvey Wood.

Cable World of March 23, 1992, stated in an article entitled "How did Monitor spend all that money?": "Although it's unclear how much of that money [estimated \$600 million Mother Church investment in the electronic media] was poured directly into the Monitor Channel, that eye-popping figure has cable insiders scratching their heads, in amazement... 'It's probably up there with some of the biggest financial failures ever seen in cable', said Kirsten Beck, author of the book *Cultivating the Wasteland* which traced cable's history."

In the midst of all of this, the 1991 Normal class included the first wife of John Hoagland, his cousin Mary Metzner Trammel, and Russ Gerber. John Hoagland's daughter-in-law, Robin Hoagland, was seated in the 2006 Normal class. Mary Trammell became a member of the Christian Science Board of Directors in July 2001. She resigned and was replaced by Robin Hoagland in January 2013. It will take time to see how the end of Mr. Hoagland's personal influence will affect the future of The Mother Church. [For more information, see Fall 2009 *Banner* and the editor's book, *Christian Science After 1910*, pages 162, 167, 168, and 184 (available from The Bookmark)]

CHURCH CLOSINGS

A comparison of the March and June 2013 *Christian Science Journals* reveals that the following seven churches have closed: Schaumburg, Illinois; Boston (3rd) (Hyde Park), Massachusetts; Marshfield, Massachusetts; Omaha (1st), Nebraska; Blowing Rock, North Carolina; Rocky Mount, North Carolina; and Blacksburg, Virginia. Since the count began in February 1987, 906

churches have closed and 79 have opened.

MONITOR FINANCES

A letter from former board chairman Virginia Harris to "All Employees of The Mother Church and The Christian Science Publishing Society" dated January 29, 2004, announced, "Next week, we will share our plans and next steps for this organization at an essential meeting for all Mother Church and Publishing Society employees..."

The meeting was held on February 4, 2004. Employees were told that expenses outpaced revenues, and the ongoing costs from the unrestricted funds amount to \$67 million. The CSPS was being called upon to break even by 2008 and to make a profit by 2009. *The Boston Globe* of February 5, 2004, reported that the church's annual subsidy of the Publishing Society had risen from \$4 million to more than \$20 million.

The October 2010 *Journal* reported: "...even though we were able to reduce our operating loss from \$21.9 million to 17.8 million last year [2009], the deficit is unsustainable and unacceptable." (p.18)

In the October 3, 2011, *Christian Science Monitor Weekly*, editor John Yemma wrote: "We're a non-profit. Over the past three years, we've reduced our losses by 25 percent, and in the coming year we'll reduce further still. If subscriptions were to pay just the costs of producing, marketing, and delivering this publication -- not counting the global reporting that goes into it [the salaries of all the worldwide correspondents and staff]-- the price would be \$200 a year. From the current \$89 a year (\$1.70 per issue), domestic subscriptions that come up for renewal will now be \$119 (\$2.25 an issue).

In the March 19, 2012, Mr. Yemma reported, "We have cut our losses in half and are on the path to become self-sustaining by 2017." (pp. 5, 6)

The March 26, 2012, C.S. *Sentinel* reported that the weekly *Monitor* "...will get a new look with the April 9, 2012, issue... A smaller format -- still 48 pages, but in a more standard magazine size -- will save a great deal in paper, printing and distribution costs." (p. 23)

The Winter 2013 *Banner* reported the required U.S. Postal Service statement of current, paid circulation for the weekly *Monitor* which showed a decline from 74,312 paid subscriptions in October 2011 to 59,775 as of October 2012 which is a reduction of 19.5% in one year.

In the April 22 & 29, 2013, *Monitor*, Mr. Yemma states, "Later this month we close our fiscal year. I'm happy to report that the *Monitor's* balance sheet is the best it's been since 1961 (that's on an inflation-adjusted basis; unadjusted, it's the best since 1978). (p. 5)

[For additional details, see *Banners* for Spring 2004, Spring 2009, Fall 2010, Fall 2012, and Winter 2013]

TREASURER'S REPORT

The 2013 Annual Meeting held in the boardroom on June 3rd included the usual abbreviated report of the treasurer, Lyon Osborne. Expenses for the past year were reported to be \$88 million. Funds on hand were given as \$632 million which represented an increase over the previous year of \$133 million. It was stated that this amount is to be used for investment purposes.

The increase of funds on hand is due, in part, to the upfront payment of \$57 million that the church received from an affiliate of Beacon Capital Partners for the 99-year lease of the 26-story administration building on the plaza. The remainder of the increase may be attributable to the forced transfer of Committee on Publication trust funds from around the world to Boston. Ostensibly, this centralization of administration was pushed through by Russ Gerber to pool all the resources to get a better interest rate. Previously, each state or national C.O.P. field took care of its own finances and expenses. The new emphasis of the C.O.P. office in Boston is to focus on social media and the use of blogs and twittering and to downplay the clearly defined role of the committees outlined by Mrs. Eddy in the *Church Manual*. [See Summer 2012 *Banner*]

MOTHER CHURCH FINANCES REPORTED AT ANNUAL MEETINGS.

Year	Funds on hand	Gen. Fund	Expenses	Indebtedness
2005	\$281m		\$69m	\$157,000
2006	361m	\$66m	97m	0
2007	474m	146m	97m	0
2008	496m	196m	113m	0
2009	379m		108m	0
2010	455m		102m	0
2011	514m		93m	0
2012	499m		99m	0
2013	632m		88m	0

REPORT ON THE 2013 ANNUAL MEETING

A complete account of the "boardroom only" Annual Meeting is available from Sheep Mailings, Inc. The internet address is: www.sheepmailings.org. Email address is: sheepmailings@coxnet.net. The mailing address is Sheep Mailings, Inc.; 5030 N. May Ave, Suite 354; Oklahoma City, OK 73112. Request the report by its date of June 17, 2013. If you request a printed version of the report, please include a donation to help defray costs.

STATUS OF THE CASSELL CASE

The arbitration hearing for the Maryfrances Cassell v. The Christian Science Board of Directors lawsuit was held on February 15, 2013, in Boston. After more than four months, no ruling had been given (at the time *The Banner* went to press).

Financial support for this case is still urgently needed. Please send donations directly to: Foehl & Eyre P.C.; 27 East Front St.; Media, PA 19063 USA. Please write "Cassell Case" in the memo section of your check.

Andrew W. Hartsook
2040 Hazel Avenue
Zanesville, Ohio 43701-2222

RETURN SERVICE REQUESTED

PRST STD
U.S. POSTAGE
PAID
ZANESVILLE, OH
PERMIT NO. 761

Lord God of Hosts, be with us yet;
Lest we forget -- lest we forget!

Rudyard Kipling

THE NEED FOR LEGAL ACTION

One hears from the Christian Science field that it is horribly wrong to resort to legal action against the Directors and that we all should just pray more earnestly to stop any blatant disobedience or disregard for Mrs. Eddy's deeds of trust, the by-laws, and the tenets of *her* Church. We hear that anybody can make a "mistake". Mrs. Eddy writes, "The author has raised up the dying, partly because they were willing to be restored, while she has struggled long, and perhaps in vain, to lift a student out of a chronic sin. Under all modes of pathological treatment, the sick recover more rapidly from disease than does the sinner from his sin." (S&H 373:6)

Mrs. Eddy's 1904 Deed of Trust states unequivocally, "...nothing herein contained shall ever be construed as a waiver or as permitting a modification in any degree the further trusts set forth...wherein it is provided that no new tenet or by-law shall be added nor any tenet or by-law amended or annulled by the grantees [the Directors], unless the written consent of said Mary Baker G. Eddy, the author of the text book 'Science and Health with Key to the Scriptures' be given therefor..." Her deeds reference Chap. 37 of Mass. law which states

that "the court may remove him [or them] and fill the vacancy" for violating the terms of the trusts. *The Banner* article in this issue titled "Deconstructing the Lesson-Sermon" gives one example of blatant, *willful* violations of the trusts. Willful disobedience is sin. One must ask a commonly heard question: What would Jesus do? Did he always say we should just pray about it? "And Jesus went into the temple of God, and cast out all them that sold and bought in the temple, and overthrew the tables of the moneychangers, and seats of them that sold doves, And said unto them, It is written, My house shall be called the house of prayer; but ye have made it a den of thieves. And the blind and the lame came to him in the temple; and he healed them." (Matt.21: 12-14)

From DIVINITY COURSE & GENERAL COLLECTANEA

Mrs. Eddy writes: "The Christian Scientist who is faithful to this Cause and its Leader will reap rewards spiritual, and blessedness beyond the power of human thought to conceive. Will you join your Leader in this, refusing sensuality, animality, lust in any of its forms? Oh, dear ones, I know the cost and I know the joy. Will you, can you, rise in this moment important for Truth?" (p. 217)

case [1994-1998] stating that, indeed, they do constitute a hierarchy. The directors' application for membership in the NCC was rejected in November 2012. The push for ecumenism has resulted in some unintended consequences. The decline of the C.S. church over the last fifty years had led other denominations to write off Christian Science as irrelevant and no longer worth serious opposition. The continual push by Shirley Paulson, Head of Ecumenical Affairs of The First Church of Christ, Scientist, for acceptance has instead re-ignited the old hostility.

ECUMENISM IN ACTION

In the wake of the Boston marathon bombing of April 15, 2013, an interfaith memorial service was organized for April 18th. President Obama was scheduled to attend. Lyle Young, Chairman of the Board of Directors, was invited to participate in the service, and he gladly accepted. The Mother Church has been a prominent fixture in Boston for more than one hundred years as the headquarters of the worldwide Christian Science church, and the representation by its board chairman at the service seemed logical. Ecumenical outreach finally seemed to be paying off. However, soon after the surprise invitation, another telephone call dis-invited Mr. Young with the explanation that there was a lack of space on the platform. He was told that others also had their invitations rescinded.

JOHN HOAGLAND JR.

The Banner received a reliable report on May 5, 2013, that John Hoagland, Jr., died on May 1st of this year. Mr. Hoagland was former manager of the Christian Science Publishing Society, Publisher's Agent for the Writings of Mary Baker Eddy, Trustee of the Publishing Society, and President and CEO of Monitor Television, Inc.

Previously, he worked for the U.S. Central Intelligence Agency from 1952 to 1961. Later he headed Hoagland & MacLachlan International, a marketing research firm in Wellesley, Massachusetts. Robert MacLachlan was one of former director John Selover's closest personal friends. Mr. MacLachlan was assigned numerous special consulting jobs for the Publishing Society and the Church. Current C.O.P. Russ Gerber was another close friend of Mr. MacLachlan.

On the board of directors of Hoagland & MacLachlan was former C.I.A. figure Richard Bissell who was linked to the failed Bay of Pigs invasion of Castro's Cuba in 1961 which used Cuban exiles as cat's-paws for the operation.

Interestingly, an internet Google search reveals almost zero information about Mr. Hoagland. Perhaps it is the privilege of former C.I.A. agents to have their personal histories scrubbed from the public record.

Mr. Hoagland is best known in church circles for his

electronic news ventures including short-wave, broadcast television, and cable TV. In September of 1988, *World Monitor*, a half-hour television news program, debuted on the Discovery Channel. *World Monitor*, a monthly magazine appeared one month later in October.

A decision by the directors and Mr. Hoagland to reduce the daily *Monitor* to a sixteen-page paper with color and no advertising was the spark which led to the mass resignation of the newspaper's editor, Katherine Fanning, and many other top writers and assistants. Previously, a decision to eliminate the daily newspaper entirely was discovered by Mrs. Fanning. It was only then that the Directors and Mr. Hoagland backed away from that plan in favor of the scaled down *Monitor*. The newspaper's advertising was diverted to the new monthly *World Monitor* magazine.

In spite of huge financial losses already incurred, the 24-hour Monitor Channel debuted on May 1, 1991. In the end, every facet of the electronic media empire failed. This was followed by the resignations of John Hoagland, Publishing Society manager Netty Douglass (later John Hoagland's second wife), and director Harvey Wood.

Cable World of March 23, 1992, stated in an article entitled "How did Monitor spend all that money?": "Although it's unclear how much of that money [estimated \$600 million Mother Church investment in the electronic media] was poured directly into the Monitor Channel, that eye-popping figure has cable insiders scratching their heads, in amazement... 'It's probably up there with some of the biggest financial failures ever seen in cable', said Kirsten Beck, author of the book *Cultivating the Wasteland* which traced cable's history."

In the midst of all of this, the 1991 Normal class included the first wife of John Hoagland, his cousin Mary Metzner Trammel, and Russ Gerber. John Hoagland's daughter-in-law, Robin Hoagland, was seated in the 2006 Normal class. Mary Trammell became a member of the Christian Science Board of Directors in July 2001. She resigned and was replaced by Robin Hoagland in January 2013. It will take time to see how the end of Mr. Hoagland's personal influence will affect the future of The Mother Church. [For more information, see Fall 2009 *Banner* and the editor's book, *Christian Science After 1910*, pages 162, 167, 168, and 184 (available from The Bookmark)]

CHURCH CLOSINGS

A comparison of the March and June 2013 *Christian Science Journals* reveals that the following seven churches have closed: Schaumburg, Illinois; Boston (3rd) (Hyde Park), Massachusetts; Marshfield, Massachusetts; Omaha (1st), Nebraska; Blowing Rock, North Carolina; Rocky Mount, North Carolina; and Blacksburg, Virginia. Since the count began in February 1987, 906

Andrew W. Hartsook
2040 Hazel Avenue
Zanesville, Ohio 43701-2222

RETURN SERVICE REQUESTED

PRST STD
U.S. POSTAGE
PAID
ZANESVILLE, OH
PERMIT NO. 761

Lord God of Hosts, be with us yet;
Lest we forget -- lest we forget!

Rudyard Kipling

THE NEED FOR LEGAL ACTION

One hears from the Christian Science field that it is horribly wrong to resort to legal action against the Directors and that we all should just pray more earnestly to stop any blatant disobedience or disregard for Mrs. Eddy's deeds of trust, the by-laws, and the tenets of *her* Church. We hear that anybody can make a "mistake". Mrs. Eddy writes, "The author has raised up the dying, partly because they were willing to be restored, while she has struggled long, and perhaps in vain, to lift a student out of a chronic sin. Under all modes of pathological treatment, the sick recover more rapidly from disease than does the sinner from his sin." (S&H 373:6)

Mrs. Eddy's 1904 Deed of Trust states unequivocally, "...nothing herein contained shall ever be construed as a waiver or as permitting a modification in any degree the further trusts set forth...wherein it is provided that no new tenet or by-law shall be added nor any tenet or by-law amended or annulled by the grantees [the Directors], unless the written consent of said Mary Baker G. Eddy, the author of the text book 'Science and Health with Key to the Scriptures' be given therefor..." Her deeds reference Chap. 37 of Mass. law which states

that "the court may remove him [or them] and fill the vacancy" for violating the terms of the trusts. *The Banner* article in this issue titled "Deconstructing the Lesson-Sermon" gives one example of blatant, *willful* violations of the trusts. Willful disobedience is sin. One must ask a commonly heard question: What would Jesus do? Did he always say we should just pray about it? "And Jesus went into the temple of God, and cast out all them that sold and bought in the temple, and overthrew the tables of the moneychangers, and seats of them that sold doves, And said unto them, It is written, My house shall be called the house of prayer; but ye have made it a den of thieves. And the blind and the lame came to him in the temple; and he healed them." (Matt.21: 12-14)

From DIVINITY COURSE & GENERAL COLLECTANEA

Mrs. Eddy writes: "The Christian Scientist who is faithful to this Cause and its Leader will reap rewards spiritual, and blessedness beyond the power of human thought to conceive. Will you join your Leader in this, refusing sensuality, animality, lust in any of its forms? Oh, dear ones, I know the cost and I know the joy. Will you, can you, rise in this moment important for Truth?" (p. 217)